



San Francisco Bay Joint Venture Management Board Meeting
Bay Area MetroCenter, 375 Beale Street Conference Room 6102, San Francisco
Tuesday, April 25, 2017 11am-2pm
MEETING NOTES

In attendance: *Anne Morkill (US Fish and Wildlife Service, Chair), Donna Ball (Save The Bay), Arthur Feinstein (Citizens' Committee to Complete the Refuge), Matt Gerhart (State Coastal Conservancy), Steve Goldbeck (BCDC, call in), Marc Holmes (The Bay Institute), Thomas Kendall (US Army Corps of Engineers), Dean Kwansy (Natural Resources Conservation Service), Greg Martinelli (California Department of Fish and Wildlife, call in), Peter Perrine (Wildlife Conservation Board, call in), Barbara Salzman (Marin Audubon Society, call in), Korie Schaeffer (NOAA Fisheries, call in), Renee Spenst (Ducks Unlimited, call in), Caitlin Sweeney (SFEP), John Takekawa (Audubon California), Julian Wood (Point Blue Conservation Science), Diane Ross-Leech (PG&E), Bruce Wolfe (San Francisco Bay Regional Water Quality Control Board), Erika Castillo (Alameda Co. Mosquito Abatement District)*

SFBJV Staff: *Beth Huning, Brenna Mahoney, Sandra Scoggin*

1. Welcome and Introductions

Anne welcomed the group and introductions were made around the table and by phone.

2. Coordinator's Report – Beth Huning, SFBJV

Beth gave the following updates:

- **Federal budget – The FY17 federal budget is due to be approved by Congress at the end of this week. Once the budget is passed, there will be 2-3 months before the SFBJV will receive our full FY17 appropriation, a cooperative agreement with the FWS and Point Blue Conservation Science, the SFBJV fiscal agent. This funding should carry the JV through most of FY18.**
- **Western Hemisphere Shorebird Reserve Network Hemispheric (WHSRN) Council Meeting – The WHSRN council is currently meeting in Tiburon April 25th-26th. Beth will make a presentation on April 26th about the SFBJV, habitat protection and restoration, and balancing competing goals and needs of wildlife species.**
- **The [State of the Estuary Conference](#) will be Oct. 10-11th, 2017. The steering committee is currently planning the program. If you have suggestions for presentations, please send them directly to Caitlin Sweeney.**

- **Society for Ecological Restoration Conference, May 3-4, 2017 - Several SFBJV partners have been invited to make presentations on climate change and restoration. Beth will present on using Structured Decision-making for climate adaptation planning, Stuart Siegel will present on climate change policy challenges, and Tom Gardali will be presenting on making restoration for species climate-smart.**
- **SFBJV fleece vests were presented to Management Board members at our October meeting and celebration. If you haven't received a vest or need a different size, contact Beth.**

3. Chair's Report and Approval of January 31, 2017 meeting notes - *Anne Morkill, USFWS*

Meeting notes from January 31, 2017 - Marc Holmes requested an amendment be made to the January 31, 2017 meeting notes in the Conservation Delivery Committee Report. The following amendment was made:

"Conservation Delivery Committee - Marc Holmes, Chair

In addition to referencing the written report in the Management Board packet, Marc focused the discussion on the importance of using the new Project Tracker site to mark progress in relation to the BEHGU goals report and the 2030 deadline. ~~report progress of the SFBJV to policy makers and funders and to describe how projects are contributing to regional restoration.~~ Marc stressed that the SFBJV focus on priorities which will include challenging discussions regarding how to produce the report with a limited budget and staff time."

Action: The meeting notes from the January 31, 2017 Management Board meeting were reviewed and approved as amended.

Management Board Chair and Vice Chair - Korie Schaeffer will become the new JV chair at the July 25th Management Board meeting, and a vice chair will be elected. As a reminder of the qualifications and role of the future chair, the currently adopted position description was distributed to all in attendance. One nominee is Caitlin Sweeney, and Jeff McCreary was placed in nomination from the floor by Marc Holmes. Both have been approached by their nominators and have agreed to serve. Additional nominations for Vice Chair should be sent to Anne and Korie. A decision will be made at the July 2017 meeting.

4. Management Board Survey - *Beth Huning, SFBJV*

- **Management Board Briefing Packets - In an effort to utilize technology and make preparation and distribution of Management Board packets more efficient, SFBJV staff prepared a survey to determine how information will be distributed in the future. Several examples of meeting-specific web pages and associated links to individual and compiled documents and files were shared, a preliminary poll was taken, followed by discussion of the pros and cons of the presented options, including "no change". Some preferences and ideas noted by Management Board members:**
 - **Need to access all documents, but not necessarily to print them all**
 - **Web pages are preferred over google docs**

- **Stitched documents (all attachments combined into a single pdf file) are easy to print, but individual documents are easy to view**
- **Finding documents through links in text is challenging, unless all documents are easily accessible in a list on a web page**
- **Reminder emails are essential**
- **Ultimately, easy preparation as well as easy access via a web page are the deciding criteria and the Management Board members left it to staff to determine how to proceed**

Action: It was agreed that Management Board meeting information and packets should be available and archived on a webpage similar to what the California State Coastal Conservancy or the SF Bay Restoration Authority meeting packets and agendas. Reminder emails with links to the webpage will continue to be sent out.

It was noted that the JV will no longer be sending hard copy in the mail to individual Management Board members who had requested them in the past. However, a limited number of hard copy packets will continue to be produced for use at the meeting.

- **Location of Management Board Meetings - In the past, the Management Board recommended that every other meeting be located centrally, accessible to public transportation, and every other meeting would be in the field with a site visit option.**

Action: It was agreed that Management Board meetings will be in a central location and accessible by public transit, with the exception of the annual retreat, which will be at a site where a field trip is an option.

5. SFBJV Working Committee Reports

Conservation Delivery Committee – Marc Holmes, Chair

The Conservation Delivery Committee did not meet as an entity, but members have been engaged in various work groups with the Implementation Plan revision.

Marc emphasized that the [SFBJV Project Tracker](#) (hosted by EcoAtlas) is an important communications tool for the SFBJV. He clarified his previous recommendation to integrate the Project Tracker into the larger SFBJV program and that information from the Project Tracker be used to track actions toward the completion of BEHGU goals and recommendations. He recommended that the Implementation Plan include information and a communications element on the Project Tracker.

Science Steering Committee -- Renee Spent, Chair (via phone)

The Science Steering Committee (SSC) has been working to refine their approach to all of the science related content and to collate science recommendations from various planning documents. The SSC has been and will remain involved with the science, habitat, species, and

monitoring and evaluation work teams to help develop content for the Implementation Plan revision.

- **Implementation Plan - Habitat Goals Development**

The SSC is developing an approach to defining habitat types and updating or setting new goals for each. The SSC is working out what goals could be set for the revised plan and what goals could be recommended as strategies to be addressed in the next 15 years. The Management Board discussed setting acreage goals for transition zones, the issues of uncertainty of sea level rise projections, changes in transition zones due to SLR, and impacts on restoration projects, as well as mapping needs. The Board agreed that a larger discussion on Transition Zone goals should take place.

- **Establishing species population objectives**

Julian Wood presented a summary of Point Blue's work to develop bird species population objectives based on the [published work by the CVJV](#) and proposed a similar process for the SFBJV. Discussion focused on habitat goals and species needs, how to track success of population objectives, multi-benefit objectives v. species-specific objectives, and using bird data to inform habitat quality. It was noted that the SFBJV has always had waterfowl goals based on the North American Waterfowl Management Plan, which were updated 2 years ago. A sub-group of the SSC will convene in May to discuss whether population targets should be established for other species and if so, which ones, and how to proceed.

- **Monitoring and evaluation framework**

Net landscape change and species response to restoration will be key to the monitoring and evaluation framework being developed for inclusion in the Implementation Plan revision. Renee asked for Management Board input on the SFBJV role in different levels of the monitoring and evaluation framework as it is developed.

- **Next steps**

Various meetings will be held soon to help develop approach and content to address the above specifics. This includes a joint SSC and CDC meeting in early June that will also address priority recommendations for implementation of the Tidal Marsh Recovery Plan.

Outreach -- Beth Huning for Caroline Warner, SFBJV

- ***Redwood Creek: Wetlands Restoration is Working video***

Sandra played the latest video produced by the SFBJV for the 20th anniversary celebration. A fourth video on Eden landing will be finished soon. These videos are available on the [SFBJV website](#). Beth asked Management Board members how they were sharing videos to their constituents and reminded them to place them on their websites and share them on social media. The videos and an outreach guide can be accessed on the SFBJV website. A suggestion was made that videos and other promotional material could also be put on flash drives with the SFBJV logo on them for distribution to legislators, partners, etc. It was noted that Government Affairs Committee members shared the videos with legislators while in DC.

- **Climate Change Messaging**

Previously-developed SFBJV climate change messages were shared and discussed with the Management Board in response to some specific language about the future of marshes under climate change in the January *Bay Nature* article. Beth reminded Management Board members to refer to these messages if they are contacted for statements or information. It was noted that magazine articles submitted by an author are not always reviewed for such messaging. No Management Board members in attendance had been contacted, but sharing the collectively-developed messages for BEHGU and climate change was a good review, particularly for newer Management Board members. The website, www.yourwetlands.org is another place to find and share outreach information.

- **Podcasts**

The SFBJV produced a [series of podcasts](#) on Flood Control 2.0. They focused on the historical ecology of creeks, the three pilot FC 2.0 projects (San Francisquito, Novato, and Lower Walnut Creeks), values of sediment, the tools developed through the FC 2.0 project, and the SediMatch website. Members were encouraged to listen to and share the podcasts with their constituents. Podcasts can be found on "[your wetlands](#)", the [SFBJV website](#) and [FC 2.0 web site](#).

Government Affairs Committee – Arthur Feinstein, Chair

- **Federal Actions**

SFBJV partners and committee members have recently traveled to Washington, DC for meetings in support of projects and funding. The JV Fly-In week was the week of February 28, when a number of JV partners were in DC and collaborated on meetings and messages. Jeff, McCreary, Fritz Reid, and Beth attended the Association of Joint Venture Management Board meeting. With a new administration and congress, the consensus was that the Fly-In was a bit too early this year. The Association will develop a year-long strategy to be in DC at important times, such as when OMB is developing budgets. It was noted that in spite of timing, congressional meetings with the Bay Area delegation were productive.

Beth asked Management Board members who will be going to DC at other times of the year to contact her so that the SFBJV can help inform messaging and suggest meetings that may benefit the JV. The Association voted to replace staffing previously conducted by the American Bird Conservancy with a contract to Ducks Unlimited.

While in DC, Government Affairs Committee members encouraged Bay Area delegates to sign the letter circulated by Congressman Garamendi that SF Bay be considered for one of 10 pilot projects for the Corps to do beneficial re-use of dredge material. Marc Holmes suggested a letter be written by Arthur to be used as needed by partners that states messaging, funding needs, SF bay designation. This letter can be printed out by organizations/agency on letterhead and signed.

The annual fact sheet that was developed by JV staff and the Government Affairs Committee was distributed. Management Board members were asked to use the fact sheets in meetings they have throughout the year with decision-makers.

- **State Actions**

[AB947](#) – Arthur alerted the Management Board to this pending bill. The original bill proposed language that would alter how DFW defines streambeds, narrowing the definition. There have since been amendments that might ease some concern, but issues remain, and the JV will continue to track the bill and alert Government Affairs Committee members if there is need for action.

- **North American Waterfowl Management Plan (NAWMP) Future of Waterfowl Workshop**
Arthur has been invited to participate in the NAWMP workshop this September in preparation for the revision of the NAWMP next year. He is considering attending. Beth will be attending as well. [NOTE AS FOLLOW-UP: Diane Ross-Leech has also been invited and is considering attending.]

- **Climate change policy white paper**

Arthur is convening a group from the Government Affairs Committee to refine the scope of work, develop a table of contents, and the process developing a white paper analyzing various climate change planning processes. It was suggested to consider involving Andy Gunther (BAECCC), Bruce Riordan (CRI), and/or Louis Bloomberg (TNC). Information that Bruce Riordan has collected on climate change policies and planning documents are available on the ABAG website.

6. Implementation Plan Update -- *Sandra Scoggin, Project Manager*

Draft Introduction for review and consensus

Sandra referred to the draft introduction in the packet that was written by John Hart. It was noted that the introduction will be revised and updated and a summary of the recommendations from the Implementation Plan will be added as the process unfolds. The intent of the discussion was not to do fine editing but to arrive at consensus as to whether the draft meets the needs.

Key points from the discussion included the following:

- **Emphasize that the SFBJV is grounded in sound science and factual information, especially as the Plan will describe how science will inform what is needed;**
- **Emphasize the call to action to follow with the momentum from BEHGU;**
- **Emphasize sea level rise setting the stage.**

The points are noted and will be addressed as the final draft is refined in the future.

Action: The draft Introduction was conditionally adopted.

Other comments

- **The SCC (and other work teams) will help develop scientific content for the Implementation Plan but some recommendations will be detailed as needs, actions, or strategies for the next 15 years.**
- **The Management Board will have the opportunity to review issues, projects, and goals presented by the Implementation Plan Team.**

Next steps

- **John Hart will be working on introductory sections of the Policy, Human Dimensions, Science, and Waterfowl sections as well as on the Project Adoption Criteria document.**
 - **Arthur noted a concern with the term 'Human Dimensions' and suggests using a different term and defining 'Human Dimensions'**
 - **It was suggested to explore the term Urban Wildlife Conservation in relation to the unique urban nature of the SFBJV.**

7. Announcements and Next Meeting, and Adjourn

The next Management Board meeting is on July 25th, 2017 at a central location accessible to public transit.

Announcements

- **The State Dredge and Fill policy will be released in mid-May. He will keep the Government Affairs Committee and Management Board apprised of any future opportunity for comment.**
- **The newly-formed House Estuary Caucus will have a reception Wednesday, May 3rd.**

The Management Board meeting of April 25, 2017 was adjourned.