



**San Francisco Bay Joint Venture Management Board Meeting  
Bay Area MetroCenter, 375 Beale Street Conference Room 6102, San Francisco**

Tuesday, October 31, 2017 10:30am-2:30pm

**MEETING NOTES**

**In attendance:** *Deb Callahan (Bay Area Open Space Council), Arthur Feinstein (Citizens' Committee to Complete the Refuge), Matt Gerhart (State Coastal Conservancy), Steve Goldbeck (BCDC), Thomas Kendall (US Army Corps of Engineers), Tom Kimball (USGS, by phone), Jeff McCreary (Ducks Unlimited), Scott McFarlin (Wildlife Conservation Board), Anne Morkill (US Fish and Wildlife Service), Chindi Peavey (San Mateo Mosquito and Vector Control), Diane Ross-Leech (PG&E), Barbara Salzman (Marin Audubon Society), Korie Schaeffer (NOAA Fisheries, chair), Renee Spenst (Ducks Unlimited), Caitlin Sweeney (SFEP), John Takekawa (Audubon California), Bruce Wolfe (San Francisco Bay Regional Water Quality Control Board), Julian Wood (Point Blue Conservation Science)*

*Guest: Dr. John Eadie (UC Davis)*

**SFBJV Staff:** *Beth Huning, Brenna Mahoney, Sandra Scoggin, Caroline Warner*

**1. Welcome and Introductions - Korie Schaeffer, Chair**

Korie welcomed Management Board members, and introductions were made.

**2. Coordinator's Report – Beth Huning, SFBJV**

Beth gave the following updates:

- *Highway 37:* Planning for the redesign of SR 37 is moving quickly. Planning processes are being coordinated by Solano County and the MTC. MTC has recognized the need to bring together the transportation and restoration communities early in the planning process. The Coastal Conservancy and the Sonoma Land Trust have been coordinating SFBJV partners to develop common goals and messages as they participate in various meetings. At the urging of the Conservancy, an environmental working group was formed by MTC. The first meeting was held on October 27. Beth reported that the first meeting went well, with planners and engineers recognizing the need to integrate the wetlands into any redesign. There will be two more meetings of the Environmental Working Group with other meetings to be held in the interim with SFBJV science experts.
- *San Geronimo Golf Course:* The golf course is a priority restoration area for coho salmon, as it represents the opportunity for floodplain restoration at the headwaters of Lagunitas Creek, the

primary watershed for recovery in the region. The SFBJV supported our agency partners the last time the course was for sale in 2008, but it was purchased by golfers. The golf course is again for sale. Golfers are not intending to purchase it this time, and the County of Marin has indicated a willingness to acquire the property for habitat and public use. Because of our historic support of the purchase for restoration, at the recommendation of the Government Affairs Committee the JV sent a letter in support of the purchase. A public hearing is occurring at the same time as this Management Board meeting, with the vote scheduled on November 14, 2017. Beth informed the Management Board that comments can be made until then.

### **3. Chair's Report and Approval of July 25, 2017 meeting notes - Korie Schaeffer, NOAA Fisheries**

Korie thanked Anne Morkill for her service as recent Chair of the Management Board and presented her with a carved decoy of a Canvasback. Anne thanked everyone and looks forward to continued involvement with the SFBJV.

*Action: The meeting notes from the July 25, 2017 Management Board meeting were reviewed and approved.*

### **4. SFBJV Working Committee Reports & 2018 Work Plan Overview**

#### **2018 Work Plan Overview - Beth Huning, SFBJV**

Beth introduced the 2018 work plan process. She described that many of the programs and operations are ongoing or will continue into 2018, including a major focus on the revision of the Implementation Plan and engagement with BCDC Bay Plan amendment process and the Adapting to Rising Tides (ART) program. She and Korie presented suggestions for finalizing the work plan. Each of the Working Committees then presented their committee reports as well as major accomplishments in 2017 and major new recommendations from the chairs.

#### **Outreach - Caroline Warner, SFBJV**

Caroline reviewed the success of the four *Wetland Restoration Is Working* videos produced to date and asked Management Board members who had been sharing them. Two more videos are in process of development with Bay Point Regional Park and Laguna de Santa Rosa Foundation, targeted for completion around the end of 2017.

In August 2017 Caroline and Melissa Pitkin facilitated a meeting of the Joint Venture regional team of communicators to discuss and identify common issues, audience types, and outreach strategies. Caroline presented how 8 key conservation issues are being addressed by SFBJV partners and how this visualization can help focus outreach efforts. This information will help the Outreach team develop outreach goals and strategies for the revised Implementation Plan and these will be discussed and finalized after other work teams have finished developing their goals.

Caroline has sent out 18 SFBJV bulletin newsletters this year. These continue to be beneficial tools for SFBJV partners.

### **Government Affairs Committee – Arthur Feinstein, Chair**

The Government Affairs Committee met on October 18 to begin the process for developing the Policy Chapter of the Implementation Plan. How the JV will address climate change, specifically the governance around the Bay Area of climate change, will be a focus of the Policy Chapter, along with several general priorities. A separate white paper is in development that will review climate change planning processes around the Bay Area and make recommendations of where and how the JV will engage. A focus of this work will be how to engage in BCDC Bay Plan Amendments, BCDC's Adapting to Rising Tides (ART) program, and the Regional Water Board's upcoming policy discussions. ART was discussed, and the Management Board recommended that JV staff routinely send out messages about the meetings to the Management Board and other SFBJV working committees.

Beth reviewed the priorities of the Government Affairs Committee to secure federal and state funding and legislation in support of the JV priority projects and programs.

- Federal - The JV remains a point of coordination for meetings in DC by JV partners, including messaging. Any partners traveling to DC from now through the end of February 2018 should coordinate together and with Beth. The annual national JV fly-in is February 26-March 2, 2018.

Beth noted that the Administration has yet to make many appointments to key positions within the Department of Interior. Therefore, some positions are being temporarily filled by detailees friendly to Joint Ventures. Some of the JV's have discussed opportunities and communications with these people and have encouraged JV partners to educate them while they are in DC at times other than the annual JV fly-in.

- State
  - Park Bond -There will be a park bond on the June 2018 ballot. Deb Callahan described the need for JV partners to engage in significant advocacy and support. The bond contains money for the Bay Conservancy and for habitat restoration.
  - Water Bond - The water bond is on track for the November 2018 ballot. It is a \$9 billion bond, of which over a billion dollars funds wetlands work, but with other water infrastructure projects included. The SFBJV should also be tracking this.
  - Measure AA - The initial RFP has been released, and project proposals are due November 15, 2017. Projects need to demonstrate how they meet SFBJV goals, and the SFBJV staff will possibly have a chance to comment.
  - This quarter the JV provided partners with information so that they can comment on the draft State Water Board dredge and fill policy.

Another goal for the Government Affairs Committee in 2018 will be to promote beneficial reuse of sediment. WRDA 2016 established 10 pilot projects for the the Army Corps to do beneficial reuse. Those projects should have been selected by now. SFBJV continues to promote projects within SF Bay as one or more of those pilots.

The Committee also recommends continued engagement with BCDC as the agency develops amendments to the Bay Plan to allow fill for restoration projects to be a high priority. Steve Goldbeck

noted that due to staff turnover, this process will not likely gain momentum until early 2018. He will keep the JV informed.

The Government Affairs Committee plans to develop a more detailed work plan before the end of the year.

**Conservation Delivery Committee (CDC) - Caitlin Sweeney, Chair**

- Project adoption request - At the most recent CDC meeting, there was a project adoption request from Dr. Katharyn Boyer of San Francisco State University for a concept pilot project in Marin to research new techniques in adapting tidal marshes to climate change. This project currently has funding for the design phase but not for implementation. The CDC recommended adoption of project but requested that Kathy and her team return to the committee to provide regular updates. It was requested that Kathy and her team address how the project will plan for the area to drain, entrap sediment, and not hold water in the high marsh.
- *Action: The project led by Dr. Katharyn Boyer was adopted as a SFBJV project by the Management Board on the condition that she provides regular updates regarding project progress and results.*

The ensuing discussion by the Management Board revolved around how projects are adopted by the CDC and the Management Board. This process will be revisited as part of the Implementation Plan revision.

**2017 Accomplishments:**

- Caitlin summarized key habitat project accomplishments in 2016-2017 and reminded everyone that information on all projects is available within EcoAtlas.
- There was one design review conducted for the Haire Ranch Unit of San Pablo Bay National Wildlife Refuge. This project is on Skaggs Island and is being designed to integrate into the larger restoration.
- Flood Control 2.0 was completed last year, and the SediMatch website was created.
- There has been a lot of work on habitat project tracking and reporting, and the JV is currently aligning project lists with the Restoration Authority.
- New dashboards are being created in EcoAtlas, and will be available in 2018. These will enable the JV to more easily summarize project information including acreage summaries, dollars spent, etc. The JV is actively conducting outreach to partners to teach them how to use EcoAtlas.
- Two new JV contractors were hired this year. Brenna Mahoney is working on the revision of the Implementation Plan, and Elisabeth Duffy is working on tracking of habitat projects.

Caitlin described the priority work plan items for this year which include supporting JV partners to achieve habitat goals, continue to improve project tracking in EcoAtlas, and engaging in the revision of the Implementation Plan.

**Science Steering Committee - Renee Spenst, Chair**

- The Science Steering Committee met more frequently this year to advance science priorities and to work on the revision of the Implementation Plan. Two new members were added, Rachel Tertes, USGS (replacing Laura Valoppi) and Christina Toms, Regional Water Board.
- Net Landscape Change:
  - The Committee discussed and agreed that, with minor modifications, a mapping tool developed by Brian Fulfroost can be used to establish baseline information for upland transition zones (UTZ).
  - The Committee prioritized completing the mudflat maps for the entire Bay. Only the South Bay was completed through the contract with Brian Fulfroost. The USFWS made a request to the National Fish and Wildlife Foundation (NFWF) for Cosco Busan funds, but NFWF was funding on-the-ground projects. Therefore the JV needs to continue to seek funds to complete the maps.
- Species Response to Restoration - Currently, the Committee is focused on developing species goals for the revision of the Implementation Plan.
- Coordinated Regional Monitoring - SFEP has an EPA grant to initiate development of a regional monitoring program. Mike Vasey (NERR) is currently representing the JV in this work.
- Sediment science - BCDC is working on a report that will identify science gaps regarding sediment.
- Future actions of the Science Steering Committee include finalizing UTZ mapping and goal setting, reviewing and finalizing the Science introduction to the Implementation Plan revision, updating and expanding the modern baylands map, and updating waterfowl targets for the Implementation Plan Revision (to be done by Mark Petrie).

**5. North American Waterfowl Management Plan (NAWMP) & Integration with the SFBJV - Dr. John Eadie, UC Davis and NAWMP Committee; Diane Ross-Leech, PG&E; Beth Huning, SFBJV**

Dr. John Eadie introduced himself and explained the overall context of the NAWMP revision plan and reports from the Future of Waterfowl 2 NAWMP workshop. Beth and Diane participated on behalf of the SFBJV. Presentations as the workshop reviewed science recommendations and user surveys. Breakout sessions included a SWAT analysis of attending organizations and agencies as to their abilities to implement NAWMP recommendations. Key take-home concepts from the FOW 2 workshop are:

- Habitat is key; habitat is what supports species.
- The NAWMP has been a very successful conservation approach, especially in regards to resiliency and adaptiveness.
- Engaging with people is very important, and there is a need to understand the new users of waterfowl, particularly the public, voters, politicians, agencies, and partners.
- Youth participants were very enthusiastic.
- Emphasizing the ecological goods and services provided to society is a way to promote messaging to achieve NAWMP goals. This can be done through messaging what is important to people. This was a top priority to understand and address.

The NAWMP Committee does regular 5-year updates to the Plan. The FOW 2 workshop was the lead-in to the 2018 update and follow-up to the implementation of the 2012 revision. NAWMP seeks to grow

the program but also to stay focused on how to distribute resources to partners without distilling efforts. John noted that the constituency is changing as they lose hunters and gain young conservationists.

The main recommendations that came from these workshops include understanding the human dimensions of the work and future clientele, measuring net landscape change, integrating ecosystem goods and services, communicating messages to the public, simplifying the structure of NAWMP, improving modeling and monitoring to be more adaptive, and focusing on what's important to managers.

The first draft of the NAWMP update will be complete by December 2017 with external review to commence in February 2018, final review by NAWMP Steering Committee by June 2018, National approval by August 2017, and signing by September 2018.

It was noted that the information from John Eadie's presentation is relevant right now to the SFBJV and the revision of the Implementation Plan.

## **6. Implementation Plan Revision**

### **Status Update - Brenna Mahoney**

Brenna provided an overview of the timeline, structure, and progress of key work groups in developing content for the revision of the Implementation Plan and on key decisions to date.

### **Open Standards for Conservation - Beth Huning and Sandra Scoggin**

Beth presented an overview of the Open Standards approach to conservation planning process and a comparison with Structured Decision-Making (SDM). The SFBJV has used the Open Standards in previous planning efforts such the NFWF business plan. The SFBJV used SDM for the Climate Adaptation Decision Support (CADS) project, and combined the two processes for the San Pablo Bay NWR climate adaptation plan. One key benefit of using Open Standards is the ability to understand the effectiveness of a program and whether actions are leading to prescribed results. Open Standards uses identified targets and threats (direct and indirect) and develops results chains that focus on achieving results.

Sandra presented recommendations on how the JV could use Open Standards in the revision of the Implementation Plan. She provided an example of JV target habitats and showed a graphical representation of how goals and indicators are nested or identified within these targets.

It was suggested that the models produced by this approach be placed online as living documents so that partners could see progress and ongoing projects.

### **Human Dimensions**

Caroline attended a training on Human Dimensions (HD) in Colorado in September 2017. In her presentation, she described what HD is and isn't and how it can be used to develop strategies for accomplishing conservation goals. She introduced the two Ashleys, Dayer and Gramza. They are HD experts who are both working to bring HD to Joint Ventures nationally. Upon request from the SFBJV,

the two of them will be providing to JV's a guiding document with suggestions for incorporating HD into their Implementation Plan revisions. In advance of the report and as a result of the training, Caroline shared her recommendations on how the SFBJV might integrate HD concepts in the Implementation Plan revision as well as proceed with a more integrated approach with the other JV working committees for outreach in the coming years.

#### **7. FY17 Budget Report and Planning for FY18 - Beth Huning, SFBJV**

Beth provide a balance sheet showing FY17 expenditures and funding projections for FY18 and described the status of SFBJV finances. She recommended that development of the FY18 budget be linked to the FY18 work plan.

The processes for developing a budget recommendation and approving the work plan were discussed. For efficiency, Korie asked the Management Board for a sense of concurrence on work plan suggestions presented during the working committee reports. Since members were in agreement, she requested that working committee chairs post their draft work plans to a Google document in the next couple of weeks. This can be refined as committees finalize their recommendations during upcoming meetings. The link will be sent to Management Board members for review and tentative approval with any further discussions to be held at the January Management Board meeting. In the meantime, staff will develop a corresponding draft budget proposal to be discussed with the Executive Committee in the context of the draft work plan.

*Action: The Management Board approved the process by consensus, including having the Executive Committee determine a process for budget adoption.*

#### **8. Procedures for SFBJV Comments and Positions on SR 37 - Renee Spenst, Ducks Unlimited**

Planning for the design of SR 37 is moving very quickly, sometimes too quickly for the JV to circulate and get approval in time to provide comments. Renee requested that the Management Board discuss how the SFBJV can engage early enough in the process so that our priorities and ideas can incorporated.

After an involved discussion, it was agreed to follow the usual procedure for providing comments on issues for which the SFBJV has not already taken a position. The SFBJV will send out an email to give the Management Board an opportunity to comment or send a draft letter for approval. Given that some of the comments will need to be turned around quickly, those who do not respond within the limited timeframe will be assumed to be in approval, unless stated otherwise.

#### **Ease of Permitting**

Renee remarked on the previous week's permit workshop where attendees discussed how to consolidate permit processes for habitat implementation projects.

A working group of Management Board members (Renee, Arthur, Barbara, and Anne) was formed to discuss and develop recommendations on behalf of the SFBJV. Their recommendations will be discussed at the January Management Board meeting.

## **9. Announcements, Next Meeting**

- There was a request made that action items on Management Board agendas be clear and detailed.
- Tom Kendall - In early December, there will be a bench dedication at Ocean Beach to Orville McGoon, founder of the coastal zone. Tom requested that Beth send out the flier announcing the dedication.
- Barbara Salzman reported that construction on the restoration project at Corte Madera will occur in November.

Dates for future meetings were announced. Please mark your 2018 calendars for January 30, April 24, July 31, and October 30.

The meeting of October 31, 2017 was adjourned.