



**San Francisco Bay Joint Venture  
Conservation Delivery Committee Meeting  
August 30, 2017 12:30 - 3:30 pm  
SFEI - 4911 Central Ave, Richmond, CA**

**MEETING NOTES**

**In attendance:**

*Marc Holmes (outgoing Chair, The Bay Institute), Caitlin Sweeney (incoming Chair, SF Estuary Program), Chris Barton (East Bay Regional Parks District), Kathy Boyer (SF State University, via phone), Erika Castillo (Alameda County Mosquito Abatement District), Jessica Davenport (State Coastal Conservancy), Aimee Good (SF Bay National Estuarine Research Reserve), Colin Grant (USFWS), Cristina Grosso (SF Estuary Institute), Doug Johnson (Cal-Invasive Plant Council), Jenna Judge (SFBay NERR, via phone), Marilyn Latta (State Coastal Conservancy), Julian Meisler (Sonoma Land Trust), Tom Robinson (Bay Area Open Space Council), Barbara Salzman (Marin Audubon), Renee Spenst (Ducks Unlimited), Rachel Tertes (USFWS), Natalie Washburn (Ducks Unlimited), Noreen Weeden (Golden Gate Audubon, via phone), Julian Wood (Point Blue), Katy Zaremba (Save the Bay)*  
JV Staff: Beth Huning, Sandra Scoggin, Liz Duffy

**1. Welcome and Introductions: Opening Remarks/Changing of Committee Leadership -  
Marc Holmes and Caitlin Sweeney**

After a round of introductions by all participants, Marc opened the meeting with a goodbye. He reminisced on his tenure as CD Committee Chair, gave a huge thank-you to everyone on the committee and the staff of the JV, then he officially passed the gavel to Caitlin Sweeney. The JV presented Marc with a full-sized wooden pintail with an inscribed plaque as a departing thank you gift.

Caitlin began by thanking Marc for his service and mentorship. Caitlin, who has been on the management board of the JV over the past 12 years (and through 2 different jobs), is excited about her new role as chair. She has relied on the CD to keep her up to speed on the multitude of wetland conservation programs and activities in the bay, and is excited to help continue the work of the CD Committee.

**2. Coordinator's Report - Beth Huning, SFBJV**

**• Bay Plan Amendments**

Over the last 18 months, the SF Bay Conservation and Development Commission (BCDC) has convened several workshops and a working group, Policies for a Rising Bay, to gather input on whether there should be amendments to the Bay Plan and the McAteer Petris Act. Several JV partners participate in these meetings to inform BCDC of the practicalities of seeking permits and restoring wetlands in an era of climate change. For summary info, see:

[www.bcdc.ca.gov/prb.html](http://www.bcdc.ca.gov/prb.html)

[www.bcdc.ca.gov/cm/2017/0707Supplemental](http://www.bcdc.ca.gov/cm/2017/0707Supplemental)

*Outcome -At its meeting on July 20, the Commission voted to issue descriptive notices for proposed Bay Plan amendments regarding fill for habitat projects and social equity. A number of SFBJV partners spoke to the issue of urgency to move forward with permitting habitat projects as per recommendations in the 2015 Baylands Goals update for climate change. The timing of such amendments was targeted as May, 2018. SFBJV staff have been in contact with BCDC staff as to how we can have input into the process sooner than later.*

• **NAWCA Small Grants**

Proposals are due on October 19th. The cap on small grants has been raised to \$100,000. JV partners have typically had a harder time getting these small grants, while being successful at getting large grants. Beth thinks that the ongoing JV effort to gain visibility added to changes to the scoring process may help JV partners to get these grants now. Beth recommends that JV partners apply during this round and into the near future. The proposal process is not as onerous as for the standard NAWCA grants.

Some tips for higher NAWCA scoring:

- NAWCA requires a 1:1 match but projects will be better scored if there's a 2:1 match.
- Being tied to a larger project really helps with a better score (acres are very important).
- If you are submitting a proposal, please let Beth know. NAWCA require that the JV rank proposals, so we need to know what is being submitted. Given at least 2 weeks lead time, Beth will review and help strengthen your proposal

• **Measure AA Grant Guidelines Update, Project Labor Agreement Requirements & Planned SFBJV Workshop**

The Measure AA Advisory Committee, which has been restructured to focus on implementation (vs. getting the measure passed) has been working on the grant guidelines. Draft guidelines have been approved by the Authority Board and are available at [http://sfbayrestore.org/docs/Grant\\_Program\\_Guidelines\\_062717\\_final.pdf](http://sfbayrestore.org/docs/Grant_Program_Guidelines_062717_final.pdf).

Also in progress is a draft RFP. While some details are still being considered (i.e., timing of CEQA permits, timing for matches, etc.), here is what we know now:

- About \$25 million available per year (there is a regional allocation based on census data, but this only applies over the full 20 year period, not annually)
- RFP will resemble existing RFP's such as the Conservancy's Prop 1.
- Timeline for release of the RFP is mid-September, 2017. Proposals will be due November 15th, 2017. Grants will be reviewed and recommended to the Authority for funding in Spring 2018.
- Go to <http://sfbayrestore.org/> and use draft RFP and guidelines to get started on proposals now, even before the RFP is released.
- Make sure your projects are up to date in the Project Tracker to ensure inclusion on the RA and JV project lists. Since the JV is written into the authorizing legislation, projects on our list will secure an additional point during the scoring process.

There will be an additional requirement for use of a project labor agreement for grants over \$500k. This is the only grant program that Beth knows of with this requirement, and she is looking for legal advice to assist JV partners. More information to come.

**3. Project Adoption Request - *New Life for Eroding Shorelines* - Kathy Boyer, SFSU**  
Sandra gave an overview of the JV project adoption process and introduced Kathy Boyer from SFSU. Kathy gave an overview of her project [New Life for Eroding Shorelines](#) for consideration as a JV project. Below is a brief summary:

Overall, the *New Life for Eroding Shorelines* project is a collaborative effort to determine the potential for coarse material and vegetation to be used to bolster shorelines. These materials would help supplement a *living shoreline*, acting as a “soft engineering” alternative to traditional “hard” solutions like bulkheads, riprap, etc., which exacerbate erosion and cut off ecosystem services. Living shorelines provide connectivity among habitats and support ecosystems, while also protecting against erosion.

This project is testing two strategies for enhancing shoreline habitat. First, coarse material (e.g., sand, gravel, shell - common historical beach materials) will be used to help build elevation and protect marshes. This material will be placed as micro-groins in strategic areas where natural processes will facilitate the positive marsh-building effects. Second, large woody debris (LWD) will be placed in the high marsh to enhance high tide refuge habitat. In this case, eucalyptus branches will be used as “arboring” (scaffolding) to support growth of succulents (pickleweed and the federally endangered sea-blite (*Sueda californica*)) into higher elevation canopies. These experimental strategies will be tested at sites in Marin County including Blackie’s Pasture and Muzzi Marsh.

Currently, the project has received \$200k from the Coastal Conservancy. The project is set to begin in fall 2017, starting with permitting, plant propagation, shoreline change analysis, and a conceptual design. Additional funding is needed to design, implement, and monitor the experimental work. Kathy is requesting adoption as a JV project to help support this project.

The following points were discussed:

- Location of experimental sites
  - Marin County, Corte Madera shoreline, exact locations TBD during initial design phase
- Placement of material on the marsh and subsequent movement
  - The edge of the marsh where erosion is worst
  - Exact locations will be determined during the design process
  - Want materials to redistribute and help build the high marsh
- Sources of sediment and LWD
  - Local sources, preferably excess material from existing projects that would otherwise be wasted
  - Possible need for treating wood
- Monitoring and expectations for success
  - Success of Aramburu project gave proof-of-concept for this project

***Outcome:*** *Since this is a unique concept, this project was recommended for conditional\* adoption by the JV. This will be further discussed and hopefully confirmed by the SFBJV Management Board at its meeting on October 31, 2017.*

\*Since this project is experimental, CD members requested a revisiting of the approval of this project at a later date before supporting other similar projects.

#### **4. Habitat Projects Update - Review current list of SFBJV Priority Projects: Sandra Scoggin, SFBJV**

Sandra redistributed the SFBJV list from the June 2 meeting and mentioned some recent updates. She thanked partners who had submitted information and encouraged everyone to look over their projects and submit any needed updates. One point of clarification was that completed projects should not be removed, but rather updated to a “completed” status so that the project tracker retains the full extent of completed, present, and future restoration.

Sandra also clarified the distinction between the Restoration Authority (RA) and JV lists, especially pertaining to Measure AA funding. The RA list includes projects that could potentially be supported with grant funds from Measure AA, without prioritizing them and without penalizing projects not on this list. The JV list is used for prioritizing projects, and being on the JV list earns projects an extra point in the RA grant scoring process. Sandra mentioned that there were efforts underway to better integrate these lists and to get RA projects represented in EcoAtlas.

#### **5. Project Tracking “Dashboard” - Using data in EcoAtlas to summarize goals and accomplishments of the SFBJV partnership - Cristina Grosso, SFEI**

Cristina addressed the many ways in which EcoAtlas and the project tracker help JV projects with reporting needs and with leveraging funding. Briefly, EcoAtlas is a data aggregation and visualization tool that helps track individual projects from a broad variety of users and looks at cumulative and regional benefits. Public users can view projects on an interactive map and also see a project information page. There are several options for filtering and displaying habitat project information, and this information can be downloaded. Currently there are approximately 2,000 JV projects (CVJV and SFBJV combined) in EcoAtlas, representing about 55% of the displayed projects.

She then introduced dashboards, summary reporting that can help track progress in different areas (e.g., acreage restored, habitat types, funding, etc.) and identify data gaps. She showed mock-ups developed by a recent working group that looked at grouping information in three potentially useful ways: by Regional Boards, Hydrologic Units, or Congressional Districts. The first phase of the Dashboard project will be completed in September 2017.

#### The following points were discussed:

- Possible types of Dashboard information and groupings that would be useful to the JV:
  - Boundaries: JV, Congressional Districts, Counties, Regional Boards, RA regions (to track Measure AA progress in funding \$ spent)
  - Federally vs. Non-Federally funded projects (or funding sources?)
  - Target vs. actual project acres
  - Cumulative change in habitat types

**Outcome:** *The group was interested in the potential of these Dashboards for JV use, especially for getting summary statistics for grants, newspaper articles, etc.*

**6. Project Update - Eradicating Invasive Sea Lavender from SF Bay Salt Marshes - Drew Kerr**  
Drew, who has been busy as the treatment manager for the Invasive Spartina project, summarized the [recent efforts to eradicate sea lavender from the Bay](#). Below is a brief summary.

There are 2 species of invasive sea lavender (*Limonium* spp.), both of which were first discovered in SF Bay in 2007 by Kathy Boyer:

- *L. duriusculum*: only found in Marin (a bigger problem in southern CA)
- *L. ramosissimum*: the primary problem species in the Bay, 1st found in San Mateo county but has since spread (found in 45+ locations as of 2015)
  - 113% increase in coverage between 2008 and 2015 (32,000 square meters)
  - 11% spread over 1 year (due to its huge seed production)
  - One of four “Highest Concern” plant species in S SF Bay Weed Mgmt Plan

Invasive sea lavender is so concerning because it forms monocultures that diminish the beneficial functions of the transition zone and high marsh. Small-scale eradication efforts have been ongoing by many partners.

In 2015, Cal-IPC received a 2-year NFWF grant to expand and improve eradication efforts. Methods included various herbicide combinations and manual removal, depending on the site. Work began with 13 sites (approximately 6 acres) and more were added in year 2 (approximately 10 acres total), including sites in Marin County. Where possible, they chose sites that could access volunteer networks to maintain work into the future. They have re-applied to NFWF for additional funding to continue and expand this work.

Take-home lessons:

- Manual removal had best success rates, but is only sustainable in areas with large volunteer populations such as in Marin County where patches are relatively smaller.
- Herbicides are next best option, especially in larger, more remote areas.
- Mechanical methods are not cost-effective at this scale.

**7. [Conservation Lands Network Update](#) - Tom Robinson, Bay Area Open Space Council**  
Tom gave an overview of the history of the Conservation Lands Network (CLN) and then introduced its most recent effort: [the Science Expansion](#). The overall goal of this project is to expand the science, use, and usability of the CLN to facilitate intentional conservation in the Bay Area.

**Key points:**

Where it all began:

- 1998: the SF Bay Program was established at the Coastal Conservancy
- 1999: released Baylands Ecosystem Habitat Goals
- 2010: added Subtidal Habitat Goals
- 2011: added Upland Habitat Goals, and re-branded as the Conservation Lands Network (CLN): a vision, a guide, and a network.

The Science Expansion is an update to the CLN - CLN 2.0

- Project timeline: 2016-2019
- Impetus: continued urban sprawl into the uplands and a need to identify and prioritize biodiversity hotspots for conservation
- Bay Area logistics are complicated: 4.8 million acres, 10 counties (Santa Cruz included), over 60 organizations. Huge effort, but a lack of cohesion.

- CLN 2.0 helps develop plans/strategies for land use, especially in the uplands.
  - Goal: identify 2 million priority acres of upland habitat by 2025 (excludes baylands)

Tom is helping to create the online mapping tool ([Explorer tool](#)) that identifies these priority acres. It uses 4 classes of hexagons to show various levels of priority areas. The tool is based on a reserve design model that:

- Prioritizes rare and riparian habitats;
- Supports protection and management; and
- Identifies conservation targets (vegetation types & landscape units);

*Action: Check it out and give feedback!*

#### **8. SediMatch- Cristina Grosso, SFEI and Sandra Scoggin**

Based on time constraints, this item was postponed to the next meeting.

#### **9. Partner Announcements and Comments**

**Colin Grant: Tidal Marsh Recovery Plan** - Species-specific teams have been created for Suisun Thistle (lead Mike Vasey), Soft bird's beak (lead Brenda Grewell) and California sea-blite (lead Wayne Ferren). These teams will collaborate with and provide expertise to the larger Recovery Implementation Team. His office has funded USGS for a Suisun Thistle mapping and propagation study. Another funding proposal for sea-blite is still under review. This study would focus on genetic analysis of Morro bay sea-blite and would help guide additional reintroduction efforts in the Bay. Contact Colin with any questions about these studies.

**Marilyn Latta: SF Estuary Invasive Spartina Project (ISP)** - The 2017 mapping and treatment season is underway from June-November for the ISP. Invasive Spartina (cordgrass) causes many impacts to mudflat and wetland habitats, including reducing biodiversity and outcompeting native plants. The project is led by the State Coastal Conservancy and USFWS, in partnership with more than 150 landowners and resource agency partners baywide. The treatment calendar and more info is at [www.spartina.org](http://www.spartina.org). The project has removed over 95% of the invasive Spartina in the bay since treatment started in 2005, bringing the total amount down from 805 net acres to less than 30 net acres as of 2016 treatment. It is critical stage of the project as we get closer to eradication, and regional communication and information sharing is crucial on such a large project covering 60,000 acres in all 9 Bay Area counties. The Conservancy asks all landowners and managers to please communicate any information on Spartina presence at newly breached sites, any plans for future restoration of sites to be breached, and make sure to wash equipment carefully between doing field work in different regions in the bay. For more info, please contact the State Coastal Conservancy ([marilyn.latta@scc.ca.gov](mailto:marilyn.latta@scc.ca.gov), 510-286-4157) or the ISP Director Peggy Olofson ([prolofson@spartina.org](mailto:prolofson@spartina.org), 510-536-4782).

**Advancing Nature-Based Adaptation Solutions in Marin County** - Up to \$750K in funding is available now for nature-based adaptation projects in Marin County (bay and coastal shorelines), for projects ranging from \$50-\$200K. Proposals are due 11/1/17. Grant RFP is available at <http://scc.ca.gov/2017/09/15/naturebased/>.

**Chris Barton:** East Bay Regional Parks District received a 300-acre donation for Coyote Hills in 2014. They initiated planning for a restoration and public access project this year (2017), which is scheduled for completion in summer/fall 2018. At McLaughlin Seashore Park, they are doing beach and dune restoration, connecting the Bay Trail near the race track, adding

parking and park furnishings, and working on the BCDC permit. They hope to go to construction next year.

At Bay Point, they are planning to restore tidal emergent wetlands along the existing trail and are working on making it resilient to sea level rise. They expect to implement the project in 2018-2019.

**Barbara Salzman**: Marin Audubon received a grant from the State Coastal Conservancy for the recently-acquired parcel next to Corte Madera Ecological Preserve and are hoping to go to construction to restore the land to tidal marsh. At Tiscornia Marsh, they are looking at ways to stabilize the shoreline and re-establish the marsh.

**Jessica Davenport**: The **State Route 37 Baylands Group** has come together to promote integration of baylands conservation and restoration goals into the proposed redesign of SR 37. The group has some funding, thanks to SFBJV, and in-kind support from several organizations. The group is developing some products and is preparing to engage with the transportation agencies in exploring the ecological opportunities and potential impacts of different design alternatives.

**Beth Huning** - The State Water Board has redrafted its [Procedures for Discharge of Dredge or Fill Material Into Waters of the State](#). This latest version provides a definition of “Waters of the State”, which was missing in previous drafts. JV partners are generally pleased with the definition, although some still have issues with a few other key provisions in the policy. The public comment period is still open, and comments are due September 18 at noon.

**10. Adjourn** - The meeting concluded with a surprise party to celebrate Marc’s long service to the Joint Venture.